



HIGH COURT OF SINDH

Technical Bid Evaluation Report

Supply and Installation of 500 KVA Prime Power diesel Generator complete imported set with factory fitted canopy (Denyo, Caterpillar or equivalent standard)

(T00712-20-0020)

Dated: 20-05-2021

Contents

1.	Procurement of 500 KVA Diesel Generator:-.....	3
2.	Tender Data Sheet:-.....	3
3.	Uploading of Tender Notice & Tender Document:-	4
4.	Clarification of Bidding Documents:-.....	4
5.	Attendance Sheet:-	4
6.	Opening of Bids:-.....	4
7.	Evaluation of Eligibility Criteria:-	5
	MANDATORY REQUIREMENT:-.....	5
	OTHER REQUIREMENT:-	5
8.	Evaluation of Technical Proposals of eligibility qualified bidders:-.....	8
10.	Summary:-.....	14
11.	Declaration:-.....	14

1. Procurement of 500 KVA Diesel Generator:-

Procurement of 500 KVA Diesel Generator for a public sector organization which involves millions of funds of public money is a very important and critical decision and must be handled with due care and diligence. Hence, all the bids were evaluated minutely on the basis of already defined eligibility and technical criteria so that the objective of best value of money may be achieved. Best value is not simply about price, but is a judgment concerning several factors including capability, capacity, past performance, and price.

It was noticed that some bidders submitted bids in very careless, casual and informal manner and did not realize that it was tender for procurement of 500 KVA Generator which has an estimated budget of approximately Rs. 18 million.

2. Tender Data Sheet:-

Purpose & Scope	500 KVA Prime Power diesel Generator complete imported set with factory fitted canopy (Denyo, Caterpillar or equivalent standard) Engine: Japan/ UK/USA/France/ Italy or equivalent/ higher standard. Dg Set Coupling: Japan/ UK/USA/France/ Italy or equivalent/ higher standard. Alternator: Japan/ UK/USA/France/ Italy or equivalent/ higher standard
Method of Procurement	Tender (Single Stage Two Envelopes Method)
Date of availability of tender document on website	Saturday 10 th April, 2021. http://www.sindhhighcourt.gov.pk/tender.php .
Date & time of Submission of Bids	On or before Monday, 26 th April, 2021 at 11:00 a.m.
Date & time of Opening of Bids	On 26 th April, 2021 at 11:30 a.m.
Venue of Bid Submission & Opening	Office of D.G (F&A), inside I.T Compound, Sindh High Court, Saddar, Karachi.
Tender Fee	Nil
Bid Security	5% of the bid price with all taxes in the form of Deposit at Call or pay order or demand draft or a Bank Guarantee as per rules.
Evaluation Criteria	Lowest evaluated bid.
Estimated Cost	Rs. 18 million approximately.
Place of delivery of items	Sindh High Court, Karachi.
Expected date of delivery	18 Weeks from the issuance of Purchase Order.
Bid Validity Period	90 days from the date of opening of bids.

3. Uploading of Tender Notice & Tender Document:-

Tender Notice and Tender Document for “**500 KVA Prime Power diesel Generator complete imported set with factory fitted canopy (Denyo, Caterpillar or equivalent standard)**” were uploaded on the official website of Sindh High Court on 07-04-2021 as well as on official website of SPPRA on 10-04-2021 under ID T00712-20-0020.

4. Clarification of Bidding Documents:-

Evaluation criteria and detailed technical specifications of the required generator were well defined in tender document. However, bidders were advised that clarifications (if any) for contents of bidding documents may be sent to the Procurement Committee in writing, at least five calendar days prior to the date of opening of bid i.e. 26-04-2021. No objections were received in writing on tender documents, eligibility criteria, technical specifications, terms & conditions and tender proceedings from any corner.

5. Attendance Sheet:-

Following bidders submitted bids on time and their representatives attended the bid meeting as reflected in attendance sheet. (copy enclosed)

S.No	Name of Bidder	Name of Representative	NTN & GST No	Contact No
1	M/s. Tricom Power SMC Pvt Ltd	Mr. Shahzad	6607907 3277876185786	0302-8272608
2	M/s. Jaffer Brothers Private Ltd	Mr. Makhdum Salman	07107790 1220999902873	0332-3765054 0346-8214641
3	M/s. N.K Thakur Enterprises	Mr. Jamshed	08790604 1700087906012	0307-2921660
4	M/s. MIA Energy Pvt Ltd	Abdul Haseeb	42140463 2600421404613	0300-2941993
5	M/s. S.M Jaffers & Company	Muhammad Faizan	02881276 1290999992591	0344-2459911
6	M/s. Allied Engineering Services Pvt Ltd	Mr. Muhammad Ali	07095899 1190999978337	0334-2615440

6. Opening of Bids:-

Tender was opened in public on already fix date and time i.e. 26th April, 2021 at 11:30 a.m. in the presence of Chairman, Members of Bid Evaluation Committee and representatives of bidders as mentioned above. No complaint was received in writing in respect of tender opening or late bids.

7. Evaluation of Eligibility Criteria:-

All Bids were evaluated on the basis of already defined eligibility criteria as mentioned below:-

Mandatory Requirement:-

S #	Details	M/s. Tricom Power SMC Pvt Ltd	M/s. Jaffer Brothers Private Ltd	M/s. N.K Thakur Enterprises	M/s. MIA Energy Pvt Ltd	M/s. S.M Jaffers & Company	M/s. Allied Engineering Services Pvt Ltd
1	NTN Certificate.	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
2	Sales Tax Certificate.	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
3	SRB Certificate.	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
4	Engineering Council Certificate.	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
5	Affidavit on given format on stamp paper.	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
6	Contract Agreement on stamp paper.	YES	YES	YES	NO	YES	YES

Other Requirement:-

S #	Particulars	Flag	Maximum Marks	1 st Bidder	2 nd Bidder	3 rd Bidder	4 th Bidder	5 th Bidder	6 th Bidder
				M/s. Tricom Power SMC Pvt Ltd	M/s. Jaffer Brothers Pvt Ltd	M/s. N.K Thakur Enterprises	M/s. MIA Energy Pvt Ltd	M/s. S.M Jaffers	M/s. Allied Engineering Services Pvt
1	<u>TYPE OF ORGANIZATION</u> (Private Limited= 10, Partnership=5, Proprietorship= 2)	A	10	10	10	02	10	05	10
2	<u>QUALITY ASSESSMENET</u> <u>(ISO CERTIFICATION FROM THE PRINCIPAL):-</u> • ISO 9001 • ISO 14001	B	10	10	10	05	10	10	10

3	<u>SOLE DISTRIBUTOR/ DEALERS:-</u> (Sole Distributor= 10 marks Dealership= 05 marks)	C	10	10	05	10	05	10	05
4	<u>BRANCH OFFICE:-</u> Four cities = 10 Marks Three cities= 8 Two cities = 6 Marks Less than two = 0 Marks	D	10	10	10	06	10	10	10
5	<u>AUDITED FINANCIAL STATEMENTS:-</u> Last Five Years Audited Report. (1 Year audited report = 02 marks. 2 Years audited report = 04 marks. 3 Years audited report = 06 marks. 4 Years audited report = 08 marks. 5 Years audited report = 10 marks.)	F	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
6	<u>ANNUAL TURNOVER (SALES OF GENERATORS) IN LAST 3 YEARS:-</u> More than 500 million=10 marks 400 to 500 million= 8 marks 300 to 400 million=6 marks 200 to 300 million=4 marks Less than 200 million= 0 mark)	G	10	10	10	06	10	10	10
7	<u>INCOME TAX RETURN</u> Income tax return 2020 = 10 Marks Income tax return 2019 = 5 Marks	I	10	10	10	10	00	10	10

8	<u>PURCHASE ORDERS :-</u> Attested Purchase Orders of generators (500 KVA or above) delivered to Public Sector Organizations / Private Sector during the last five years.	J	20	05	00	00	00	00	10
9	<u>PURCHASE ORDERS OF SIMILAR MODEL OF GENERATOR:-</u> Attested Purchase Orders of similar model of Generator which is being offered to Sindh High Court through this tender.	K	10	04	00	00	00	00	10
	<u>Total Marks Obtained</u>			79	65	49	55	65	85
	<u>Remarks</u>			PASS	FAIL	FAIL	FAIL	FAIL	PASS
	Passing Marks= 70%								

S.No	Name of Bidder	Marks Obtained	Remarks
1	M/s. Tricom Power SMC Pvt Ltd	79	PASS
2	M/s. Jaffer Brothers Private Ltd	65	FAIL
3	M/s. N.K Thakur Enterprises	49	FAIL
4	M/s. MIA Energy Pvt Ltd	55	FAIL
5	M/s. S.M Jaffers & Company	65	FAIL
6	M/s. Allied Engineering Services Pvt Ltd	85	PASS

S.No	Name of Bidder	Remarks
1	M/s. MIA Energy Pvt Ltd	It was clearly mentioned in tender document that Purchase Orders must be attested from the concerned organizations. In case, attested Purchase Orders are not available then Delivery Challans are mandatory . It was further mentioned that Purchase Orders shall not be considered if the required columns regarding Purchase Orders are not completely filled. Despite the clear instructions, the same were not followed by M/s. MIA Energy, M/s. Jaffers Brothers Pvt Ltd and M/s. S.M Jaffers & Company. Neither attested Purchase Orders were furnished nor delivery challans were provided. Further, relevant information of delivery challans was not mentioned in the relevant columns of tender documents.
2	Jaffer Brothers Pvt Ltd	
3	S.M. Jaffer & Company	

8. Evaluation of Technical Proposals of eligibility qualified bidders:-

Evaluation of Technical Proposal of M/s. Tricom Power (SMC) Pvt Ltd

Requirement of Sindh High Court		Specifications offered by M/s. Tricom Power (SMC) Pvt Ltd	Remarks
Features	Details		
Model	Complete imported assembled generator set with factory fitted canopy (Denyo, Caterpillar or equivalent standard)	Model of Generator is not mentioned.	<p>The bidder did not bother to mention model of offered product. Instead of mentioning the mode of Generator, the bidder has mentioned as under: <i>"Technical Specifications attached."</i></p> <p>It is pertinent to mention here that it was clearly mentioned in tender document that technical proposal must be submitted on the prescribed format of SHC. Technical Proposal submitted on any other format shall be rejected being non-responsive.</p> <p>Technical Team of M/s. Tricom Power (SMC) Pvt Ltd has submitted technical proposal in a very casual and informal manner and failed to give respect to the required specifications of the Hon'ble Sindh High Court.</p>
Prime Power	Minimum 500 KVA	Bidder has only mentioned "Complied"	<p>Prime Power which is the major requirement for evaluating the technical proposal is not mentioned. Instead of mentioning the prime power, the bidder has written "Complied".</p> <p>The bidder should have clearly mentioned the Prime Power of the product which is being offered through the instant tender.</p>
DGSET Manufacturing Year	2020-2021	Bidder has only mentioned "Complied"	<p>The requirement of the Hon'ble Sindh High Court was that DGSET should be manufactured between 2020 to 2021. The bidder should have mentioned the year of manufacturing year but instead of mentioning the same, the bidder has written "complied". Hence, the main requirement of manufacturing year cannot be evaluated through the furnished technical proposal. It appears that technical proposal has been prepared in non-technical and unprofessional manner.</p>

Engine	Japan/ UK/USA/France/ Italy or equivalent/ higher standard.	2506A- E15TAG2 (Perkins)	Country of origin of Engine is not mentioned as required by SHC.
Alternator	Japan/ UK/USA/France/ Italy or equivalent/ higher standard	TAL 047C (Leroy Somer)	Country of origin of Alternator is not mentioned as required by SHC.
Number of Phases	3-Phase, 4-Wire	Bidder has only mentioned "Complied"	
Built in weather & sound proof factory fitted imported Canopy.	The generator and electrical components should fully enclose in a solid-steel factory fitted imported (or equivalent standard) weather & sound proof canopy	Bidder has only mentioned "Complied"	Detailed of canopy and its features should have been mentioned in technical proposal. Technical Proposal of M/s. Tricom Power cannot be evaluated on the basis of incomplete information.
Fuel Tank Capacity (L)	700 liters or higher	Bidder has only mentioned "Complied"	The Procurement Committee cannot evaluate whether the generator set offered by the bidder meets the requirement of fuel tank capacity of 700 liters or otherwise.
Maintenance	All daily maintenance requirements can be performed from one side of the machine. There should be full access to the engine. Should have external drain plugs for oil, fuel and water so that routine maintenance can be performed easily. For major engine overhauls, the canopy (bonnet) can be unbolted.	Bidder has only mentioned "Complied"	
Auto Protection	In-built emergency system to detect low oil pressure, high water temperature,	Bidder has only mentioned "Comply"	The bidder has failed to provide the required information regarding safety & protection which is an important feature of 500 KVA generator which requires huge

	charging failure etc.		funds on procurement.
Batteries (Maintenance free)	Dry type (imported) or equivalent standard	Bidder has only mentioned “Comply”	The bidder has failed to provide information regarding batteries. The Procurement Committee cannot ascertain whether dry type batteries are imported or local/equivalent standard.
Delivery	18 Weeks from the issuance of Purchase Order.	Bidder has only mentioned “Comply”	
Warranty	24 months warranty effective from the date of installation. (with parts, labour and onsite)	Bidder has only mentioned “Comply”	
Mainten ance	Free Service for one year from the date of installation. (Minimum one service every month)	Included and complied. (without parts and labour)	
No of 500 KVA generator required	ONE (01)	Ok and complied.	YES
Has the bidder i.e. M/s. Tricom Power (SMC) Pvt Ltd followed the format of technical proposal as mentioned in technical proposal?			No
Has the bidder i.e. M/s. Tricom Power (SMC) Pvt Ltd provided the information sought in technical proposal?			No
Has the bidder i.e. M/s. Tricom Power (SMC) Pvt Ltd fulfilled all the technical requirements of Sindh High Court?			No
Has the bidder i.e. M/s. Tricom Power (SMC) Pvt Ltd qualified the technical evaluation criteria?			No Technical Proposal is rejected being non- responsive
Is the bidder i.e. M/s. Tricom Power (SMC) Pvt Ltd eligible for opening of financial proposal?			No

Technical Proposal is an important document in procurement through single stage two envelopes method. Technical Proposal is a platform to communicate your product and capabilities with the procuring agency. It is an opportunity to win over the evaluation panel. It is the main responsibility of the technical team of bidder to think carefully about the needs and requirements of procuring agency listed in tender document and speak to each of them in your technical proposal. Enough information as per requirement of procuring agency must be provided so that the same can be easily evaluated.

It is an understood fact that the procuring agency evaluates the technical proposal on the basis of requirements and specifications which are mentioned in tender document. Bid Evaluation Committee evaluate only the text in the technical proposal without making assumptions.

M/s. Tricom Power (SMC) Pvt Ltd has submitted its technical proposal in very careless, casual and informal manner. It should be noted that public sector organizations rely on a competitive process to select the bidder who offer the best value. Best value is just more than price, it also involves technical factor as well. In fact, the technical aspects of a proposal are more often important than those involving price. Hence, bidder should draft their technical proposal in professional way in order to differentiate their business from their competitors.

<u>Evaluation of Technical Proposal of M/s. Allied Engineering & Services Pvt Ltd</u>			
Requirement of Sindh High Court		Specifications offered by M/s. Allied Engineering & Services Pvt Ltd	Complied with the requirements of SHC?
Features	Details		
Model	Complete imported assembled generator set with factory fitted canopy (Denyo, Caterpillar or equivalent standard)	Caterpillar-USA Diesel Generator Model: DE550EO/C15 Rating: 550 KVA Standby or Rating: 500 KVA Prime Power 02 Years Warranty	YES
Prime Power	Minimum 500 KVA	Rating: 550 KVA Standby Power Generation. Rating: 500 KVA Prime Power Generation.	YES
DGSET Manufacturing Year	2020-2021	Manufacture Year 2021 Caterpillar USA Facility.	YES
Engine	Japan/ UK/USA/France/ Italy or equivalent/ higher	Manufactured by Caterpillar USA with in different regions facilities (USA, Germany, Canada, UK,	YES

	standard.	Belgium, China, India, Netherland etc.)	
Alternator	Japan/ UK/USA/France/ Italy or equivalent/ higher standard	Manufactured by Caterpillar USA with in different regions facilities (USA, Germany, Canada, UK, Belgium, China, India, Netherland etc.)	YES
Number of Phases	3-Phase, 4-Wire	3-Phase, 4-Wire.	YES
Built in weather & sound proof factory fitted imported Canopy.	The generator and electrical components should fully enclose in a solid-steel factory fitted imported (or equivalent standard) weather & sound proof canopy	Supplying local made (standard caterpillar specifications canopy) with sound/ weather/ dust/ noise/ balance canopy. 02 years warranty with installation, commissioning, balancing and placement canopy on foundations, pads, floor.	YES
Fuel Tank Capacity (L)	700 liters or higher	Built in fuel tank by Caterpillar- USA 935 liters.	YES
Maintenance	All daily maintenance requirements can be performed from one side of the machine. There should be full access to the engine. Should have external drain plugs for oil, fuel and water so that routine maintenance can be performed easily. For major engine overhauls, the canopy (bonnet) can be unbolted.	Local made canopy manufactured as per Caterpillar specifications & standards and have extra area for routine maintenance and services, troubleshooting work, maintenance work on generator depends on the conditions because maintenance work will be carried from all four sides of generator in canopy.	YES
Auto Protection	In-built emergency system to detect low oil pressure, high water temperature, charging failure etc.	Built in Caterpillar- USA emergency safeties for the defect low oil pressure, high jacket water temperature, charging failure etc.	YES
Batteries (Maintenance free)	Dry type (imported) or equivalent standard	Built-in imported Caterpillar-USA batteries LEAD ACID BATTERIES with 02 years	YES




		warranty.	
Delivery	18 Weeks from the issuance of Purchase Order.	Agreed with demand of tender. Delivery of generator will be within 18 weeks of Purchase Order.	YES
Warranty	24 months warranty effective from the date of installation. (with parts, labour and onsite)	Warranty for all Caterpillar's (CAT D.G and Local make canopy) supplied will be 24 months from the date of installation OR 8000 hours from the date of commissioning whichever comes earlier.	YES
Maintenance	Free Service for one year from the date of installation. (Minimum one service every month)	12 visits for one year on monthly basis. Monthly visit for detailed inspection & assessments, 04 sets of preventive maintenance services of spare parts for one year or 1000 hours, PMS after every 250 hours. 1 complete set of spare parts was installed built in.	YES
No of 500 KVA generator required	ONE (01)	We will provide one complete Caterpillar-USA Generator Set 500 KVA prime power ratings.	YES
Has the bidder i.e. M/s. Allied Engineering & Services Pvt Ltd followed the format of technical proposal as mentioned in technical proposal?			Yes
Has the bidder i.e. M/s. Allied Engineering & Services Pvt Ltd provided the information sought in technical proposal?			Yes
Has the bidder i.e. M/s. Allied Engineering & Services Pvt Ltd fulfilled all the technical requirements of Sindh High Court?			Yes
Has the bidder i.e. M/s. Allied Engineering & Services Pvt Ltd qualified the technical evaluation criteria?			Yes
Is the bidder i.e. M/s. Allied Engineering & Services Pvt Ltd eligible for opening of financial proposal?			Yes

10. Summary:-

- a. Tender Notice & Document for supply and installation of 500 KVA Prime Power diesel Generator complete imported set with factory fitted canopy (Denyo, Caterpillar or equivalent standard) were uploaded on the relevant websites on 07-04-2021 and no objection (s) were received in writing regarding eligibility criteria, specifications and other contents of tender document.
- b. Total six (06) bidders i.e. M/s. Tricom Power (SMC) Pvt Ltd, M/s. Allied Engineering & Services Pvt Ltd, M/s. Jaffer Brothers Pvt Ltd, M/s. S.M Jaffer & Company, M/s. N.K Thakur Enterprises and M/s. MIA Energy Pvt Ltd submitted bid which were opened in the presence of their representatives on 26th April, 2021 at 11:30 a.m. as reflected in attendance sheet.
- c. M/s. Jaffer Brothers Pvt Ltd, M/s. S.M Jaffer & Company, M/s. N.K Thakur Enterprises and M/s. MIA Energy Pvt Ltd could not qualify the already defined eligibility criteria which was mandatory to evaluate the financial stability, past experience, quality management system and other factors as mentioned in tender document.
- d. Technical proposals of remaining two bidders i.e. M/s. Tricom Power (SMC) Pvt Ltd and M/s. Allied Engineering & Services Pvt Ltd were evaluated on the basis of already defined technical specifications.
- e. M/s. Tricom Power (SMC) Pvt Ltd submitted technical proposal in very casual and informal manner and did not bother to mention the make & model of generator, country of origin of engine, alternator, fuel tank capacity and other important specifications. Hence, the said technical proposal was rejected as mentioned in technical evaluation.
- f. M/s. Allied Engineering and Services Pvt Ltd offered Caterpillar-USA Diesel Generator Model: DE550EO/C15 which met all the technical requirement of Hon'ble Sindh High Court and qualified the technical evaluation criteria and qualified for opening of financial proposal.

11. Declaration:-

Due care has been taken to ensure accuracy & correctness in compilation of bid evaluation report. However, Bid Evaluation Committee reserves the right of rectifying any error and/ or omission etc. at any time as per rules.

 Kamran Ahmed Hamidi Director General (Finance & Accounts) Chairman	
 Saleem Shaikh Deputy Registrar (Accounts) Member	 Muhammad Shahid Hassan Accounts Officer/ Nominee of A.G Sindh Member

Copy is forwarded to the I/c: Director I.T with request to direct the concerned to upload the bid evaluation report on the official website of this Court.